

PLANNING COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD AT PENALLTA HOUSE, YSTRAD MYNACH (CHAMBER) ON WEDNESDAY, 4TH NOVEMBER 2015 AT 5.00PM

PRESENT:

Councillor D.G. Carter - Chair Councillor W. David - Vice-Chair

Councillors:

M. Adams, Mrs E. M. Aldworth, D. Bolter, Mrs P. Cook, J.E. Fussell, Mrs J. Gale, L. Gardiner, A. Lewis, K. Lloyd, Mrs G.D. Oliver, D. Rees, J. Simmonds, Mrs J. Summers, J. Taylor.

Together with:

P. Elliott (Head of Regeneration and Planning), T. Stephens (Development Control Manager), R. Crane (Solicitor), R. Amundson (Principal Planner), M. Davies (Principal Planning Enforcement Officer), G. Lewis (Team Leader - Planning), C. Powell (Area Senior Planner), A. Pyne (Area Senior Planner), M. Godfrey (Team Leader - Environmental Health) and R. Barrett (Committee Services Officer)

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors J. Bevan, R.W. Gough, A.G. Higgs and Mrs E. Stenner.

2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Declarations of interest were received as follows:- 14/0836/FULL and 15/0023/COU - Councillor W. David, 14/0836/FULL – Councillor D. Bolter, 15/0023/COU – Mrs E.M. Aldworth and 14/0855/FULL – R. Crane (Solicitor). Details are minuted with the respective item.

3. MINUTES - 7TH OCTOBER 2015

Councillor K. Lloyd asked for it to be noted that he did not attend the Planning Committee meeting of 7th October 2015 but had been recorded as being both present and having given his apologies.

Subject to the above amendment, it was

RESOLVED that the minutes of the Planning Committee held on 7th October 2015 (minute nos. 1 - 20) be approved and signed as a correct record.

4. TO RECEIVE ANY REQUESTS FOR A SITE VISIT

Requests for site visits were received and accepted by Members of the Planning Committee, as follows:

- (1) Code No. 15/0601/FULL Land at Nine Mile Point Industrial Estate, Cwmfelinfach, Newport;
- (2) Code No 15/0979/FULL Land at Ogilvie Terrace, Deri, Bargoed;
- (3) Code No. 15/0488/RET Gelliargwellt Uchaf Farm, Gelligaer Road, Gelligaer, Hengoed;
- (4) Code No. 15/0670/FULL Former Saron Congregational Church, Pandy Road, Bedwas, Caerphilly;
- (5) Code No 15/0775/COU Bank Chambers, 2 Pandy Road, Bedwas, Caerphilly;
- (6) Code No. 15/0914/FULL Craig Bach, Penrhiw Lane, Machen, Caerphilly.

5. SITE VISIT CODE NO. 15/0252/OUT - LAND AT CWMGELLI, BLACKWOOD, NP12 1BZ

Mr T. Watkins, on behalf of local residents, and Councillor N. Dix spoke in objection to the application. Mr P. Sulley, the applicant's agent, spoke in support of the application.

Following consideration of the application it was moved and seconded that the application be refused in that the development is outside the settlement boundary and lies within an identified green wedge, and as such is contrary to Caerphilly County Borough Council planning policy. By a show of hands, this was unanimously agreed.

RESOLVED that: -

- (i) the site visit report be noted;
- (ii) the application be refused.

6. SITE VISIT CODE NO. 15/0433/FULL - PEN-Y-FAN FARM, PEN-Y-FAN FARM LANE, MANMOEL, BLACKWOOD, NP12 0HZ

Mrs J. Morgan, on behalf of local residents, spoke in objection to the application and Mr A. Kirby, the applicant's agent, spoke in support of the application.

Following consideration of the application, it was moved and seconded that the application be deferred for a further report with reasons for refusal based on the impact of the development on the local landscape.

An amendment was moved and seconded in that the application be granted in accordance with the recommendation contained within the Officer's report.

In accordance with Rule of Procedure 15.4(1) a request was made for a recorded vote.

FOR THE AMENDMENT

Councillors M. Adams, Mrs E.M. Aldworth, D.G. Carter, W. David, J.E. Fussell, Mrs J. Gale, Mrs G.D. Oliver, D. Rees and J. Simmonds (9).

AGAINST THE AMENDMENT

Councillors D. Bolter, Mrs P. Cook, L. Gardiner, A. Lewis, K. Lloyd, Mrs J. Summers and J. Taylor (7).

The amendment was won and, as the substantive motion, was declared carried.

RESOLVED that: -

- (i) the site visit report be noted;
- (ii) subject to the conditions contained in the Officer's report and the following additional condition, this application be granted;

Condition (24)

Prior to the delivery of any components a highway condition survey along Manmoel Road shall be carried out and agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority. The agreed survey shall include a scheme and timetable for the repair of any damage caused to the highway by delivery vehicles associated with this development. The development shall thereafter be carried out in accordance with those agreed details.

Reason

In the interests of highway safety.

- (iii) the applicant be advised that the following policies of Caerphilly County Borough Local Development Plan up to 2021 - Adopted November 2010 are relevant to the conditions of this permission: CW2 and CW4;
- (iv) the applicant be advised of the comments of the Council's Ecologist, Countryside and Landscape Services, Senior Arboricultural Officer (Trees), Glamorgan Gwent Archaeology Trust, Natural Resources Wales, Gwent Wildlife Trust, Senior Engineer (Land Drainage) and Dwr Cymru/Welsh Water;

7. SITE VISIT CODE NO. 15/0451/FULL - LAND AT PEN-YR HEOL-LAS, MANMOEL ROAD, MANMOEL, NP12 0RQ

Mrs D. Jones, on behalf of local residents, spoke in objection to the application and Mr B. Sharpe, the applicant, spoke in support of the application.

Following consideration of the application, it was moved and seconded that the application be deferred for a further report with reasons for refusal based on the overbearing impact of the development on neighbouring properties. By a show of hands (and in noting there were 11 against), the motion was declared lost.

It was moved and seconded that the recommendation contained in the Officer's report be approved, and by a show of hands (and in noting there were 4 against), this was agreed by the majority present.

RESOLVED that: -

- (i) the site visit report be noted;
- (ii) subject to the conditions contained in the Officer's report, and the following amended and additional conditions, this application be granted;

Amended Condition (10)

Notwithstanding the submitted plans, revised details shall be submitted for consideration and approval in writing with the Local Planning Authority, in respect of the design of the substation, which shall include a pitched roof building with either a stone/timber clad or rendered finish to the external walls.

The development shall be carried out in accordance with the agreed details.

Reason

In the interests of visual amenity.

Amended Condition (11)

Prior to the commencement of the development a scheme depicting hard and soft landscaping shall be submitted to and agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Those details shall include:

- (a) Proposed finished ground levels or contours; means of enclosure; car parking layouts; other vehicle and pedestrian access and circulation areas; hard surfacing materials; minor structures including furniture, refuse or other storage units; and
- Proposed and existing functional services above and below ground (e.g. drainage, power, communications cables, pipelines etc. indicating lines, manholes etc.); and
- (c) Planting plans; written specifications (including cultivation and other operations associated with plant and grass establishment); schedules of plants, noting species, plant sizes and proposed numbers/densities where appropriate.

The development shall be carried out in accordance with the agreed scheme and all planting, seeding, turfing/hard landscaping works comprised in the approved details of landscaping shall be carried out in the first planting season following the occupation of the buildings or the completion of the development, whichever is the sooner. Any trees or plants which within a period of 5 years from the completion of the development die, are removed or become seriously damaged or diseased shall be replaced in the next planting season with others of similar size and species, unless the Local Planning Authority gives written consent to any variation.

Reason

In the interests of the visual amenity of the area.

Additional Condition (15) – replaces original Condition (15)

Prior to the commencement of works on site details of the protection measures for both construction traffic and permanent vehicle access traversing the strategic water main shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. These shall include a construction design method statement and risk assessment for the protection of structural condition of the strategic water main crossing the site. Thereafter no other development pursuant to this permission shall be carried out until the approved protection measures have been implemented in full and the protection measures shall be retained at all times until the development is complete.

Reason

To protect the structure and integrity of the asset crossing the proposed development site

Amended Condition (16)

Prior to the development commencing on the construction of any roads, drainage, or buildings hereby approved a scheme for dust mitigation (including wheel washing facilities for vehicles leaving the site) shall be submitted to and agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority. Thereafter the agreed scheme shall be employed as necessary to deal with dust arising from construction works.

Reason

In the interests of the amenity of the area.

Amended Condition (22)

The wearing course of all access tracks/vehicle routes through the site hereby approved shall be constructed of locally occurring sandstone unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.

Reason

To reflect the underlying geology of the site.

- the applicant be advised that the following policies of Caerphilly County Borough Local Development Plan up to 2021 - Adopted November 2010 are relevant to the conditions of this permission: CW2 and CW3;
- (iv) the applicant be advised of the comments of Natural Resources Wales, Glamorgan Gwent Archaeology Trust, Heddlu Gwent Police, Rights of Way Officer, Nats, Council's Ecologist, Senior Arboricultural Officer (Trees) and Countryside and Landscape Services.

8. SITE VISIT CODE NO. 14/0836/FULL - THE SURGERY, OAKFIELD STREET, YSTRAD MYNACH, HENGOED, CF82 7WX

Councillors W. David and D. Bolter declared a prejudicial interest in that they are both patients at the surgery and left the Chamber when the application was discussed.

In referring to the site visit report which outlined Members' concerns regarding the proposed location of pedestrian access, Officers confirmed that a resolution had been reached on this matter and the applicant had agreed to amend the application to relocate pedestrian access to a more suitable position.

Following consideration of the application, it was moved and seconded that the recommendation contained in the Officer's report be approved and by a show of hands this was unanimously agreed.

RESOLVED that: -

- (i) the site visit report be noted;
- subject to the conditions contained in the Officer's report, and on receipt of satisfactory revised plans showing the position of the gate relocated, Officers grant planning permission under their delegated powers;
- (iii) the applicant be advised that the proposed white lining works shall be undertaken using a competent white lining contractor with both the appropriate licences to work within the highway, along with an adequate level of public liability insurance. For the avoidance of doubt, the applicant should be advised to contact the Highways Operations Group on (01495) 235323 in this respect. Any unlicensed work in, or disturbance of, the highway will be considered to be causing damage to the highway which is an offence under the Highways Act 1980, and may result in legal action being taken in order to rectify matters;

- (iv) the applicant be advised that works should not take place that will disturb nesting birds from March to July inclusive. All British birds (while nesting, building nests and sitting on eggs), their nests and eggs (with certain limited exceptions) are protected by law under Section 1 of the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981 (as amended) and the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000. If birds are nesting on /in or within the vicinity of the proposed development, work should be undertaken outside the breeding season for birds to ensure their protection, i.e. works should only be undertaken between August and February. Further advice on the above can be sought from the local authority ecologists (01495 235253) or Natural Resources Wales (NRW) (02920 772400);
- (v) the applicant be advised to contact the Environmental Health Officer on 01495 235028 to discuss management of pedestrian access within the site.

9. SITE VISIT CODE NO. 14/0855/FULL - LAND AT WATFORD ROAD, CAERPHILLY

R. Crane (Solicitor) declared a prejudicial interest in that he has friends who live adjacent to the site and who have objected to the application, and left the Chamber when the application was discussed.

Mr A. Pritchard, on behalf of local residents, and Councillor S. Kent spoke in objection to the application. Mr B. Davies, the applicant's agent, spoke in support of the application.

Following consideration of the application, it was moved and seconded that the application be deferred for a further report with reasons for refusal based on the impact of the development on the local landscape. By a show of hands, and in noting there were 11 against, the motion was declared lost.

It was moved and seconded that the recommendation contained in the Officer's report be approved, and by a show of hands (and in noting there were 2 against), this was agreed by the majority present.

In accordance with Rule of Procedure 15.5 Councillor J.E. Fussell wished it recorded that he had voted against the application.

RESOLVED that: -

- (i) the site visit report be noted;
- (ii) the application be deferred to allow the applicant to enter into a Section 106 Agreement as set out in the Officer's report;
- (iii) on completion of the Agreement and subject to the conditions contained in the Officer's report, this application be granted;
- the applicant be advised of the comments of Wales and West Utilities, Senior Engineer (Land Drainage), Gwent Police, the Council's Ecologist, Dwr Cymru/Welsh Water and Head of Public Services that are brought to the applicant's attention;
- (iv) the applicant be advised that the following policies of Caerphilly County Borough Local Development Plan up to 2021 - Adopted November 2010 are relevant to the conditions of this permission: CW2, CW3 and CW6.

PLANNING APPLICATIONS UNDER THE TOWN AND COUNTRY PLANNING ACT - NORTH AREA

10. CODE NO. 15/0597/FULL – PEN-YR-HEOL FARM, COMMIN ROAD, HOLLYBUSH, BLACKWOOD.

Mr R. Evans, the applicant, spoke in support of the application.

Following consideration of the application, it was moved and seconded that the application be deferred for a further report with reasons to grant based on the comments received. By a show of hands (and in noting there were 4 against), this was agreed by the majority present.

RESOLVED that the application be deferred for a further report for reasons to grant based on the comments received at the meeting.

11. CODE NO. 15/0601/FULL – LAND AT NINE MILE POINT INDUSTRIAL ESTATE, CWMFELINFACH

Having regard to the impact of the development on residential amenity and highway safety, it was moved and seconded that the application be deferred for a site visit (all Members) and by a show of hands this was unanimously agreed.

RESOLVED that the application be deferred for a site visit.

12. CODE NO. 15/0978/FULL – LAND AT OGILVIE TERRACE, DERI, BARGOED

Having regard to the impact of the development on residential amenity and highway safety, it was moved and seconded that the application be deferred for a site visit (all Members) and by a show of hands this was unanimously agreed.

RESOLVED that the application be deferred for a site visit.

PLANNING APPLICATIONS UNDER THE TOWN AND COUNTRY PLANNING ACT - SOUTH AREA

13. PREFACE ITEM CODE NO. 15/0023/COU – MANCHESTER HOUSE, 1 CLIFTON STREET, CAERPHILLY

Councillor W. David declared a prejudicial interest in that the speaker in objection to the application is a close friend of his son and left the Chamber when the application was discussed.

Councillor Mrs E.M. Aldworth declared a prejudicial interest in that a relative leases a premises from the applicant, and left the Chamber when the application was discussed.

Following consideration of the Officer's preface report and original report it was moved and seconded that the application be refused for the reasons contained within the Officer's preface report. By a show of hands (and in noting there was one abstention) this was agreed by the majority present

RESOLVED that the application be refused.

14. CODE NO. 15/0422/RET - WHITE HART INN, 19 CHURCH STREET, BEDWAS, CAERPHILLY CF83 8EA

Following consideration of the application it was moved and seconded that the recommendation contained in the Officer's report be approved and by a show of hands this was unanimously agreed.

RESOLVED that: -

- (i) subject to the conditions contained in the Officer's report, this application be granted;
- (ii) the applicant be advised of the comments of the Conservation and Design Officer that are brought to the applicant's attention;
- (iii) the applicant be advised that the following policies of Caerphilly County Borough Local Development Plan up to 2021 - Adopted November 2010 are relevant to the conditions of this permission: CW2, CW15 and SP6.

15. CODE NO. 15/0471/LBC - WHITE HART INN, 19 CHURCH STREET, BEDWAS, CAERPHILLY CF83 8EA

Following consideration of the application it was moved and seconded that the recommendation contained in the Officer's report be approved and by a show of hands this was unanimously agreed.

RESOLVED that: -

- (i) the application be deferred to allow it to be referred to CADW for its consideration;
- In the event that CADW does not raise any objections to the scheme, subject to the conditions contained in the Officer's original report, listed building consent for the application be granted;
- (iii) the applicant be advised of the comments of the Conservation and Design Officer that are brought to the applicant's attention;
- (iv) the applicant be advised that the following policies of Caerphilly County Borough Local Development Plan up to 2021 - Adopted November 2010 are relevant to the conditions of this permission: CW2, CW15 and SP6.

16. CODE NO. 15/0488/RET - GELLIARGWELLT UCHAF FARM, GELLIGAER ROAD, GELLIGAER, HENGOED, CF82 8FY

Having regard to the impact of the development on residential amenity, it was moved and seconded that the application be deferred for a site visit (all Members) and by a show of hands this was unanimously agreed.

RESOLVED that the application be deferred for a site visit.

17. CODE NO. 15/0670/FULL - FORMER SARON CONGREGATIONAL CHURCH, PANDY ROAD, BEDWAS, CAERPHILLY

Having regard to the visual impact of the development on the local landscape, it was moved and seconded that the application be deferred for a site visit (all Members) and by a show of hands (and in noting there were 2 against) this was agreed by the majority present.

RESOLVED that the application be deferred for a site visit.

18. CODE NO. 15/0764/COU - UNIT 18, CASTLE COURT, CAERPHILLY, CF83 1NU

Following consideration of the application it was moved and seconded that the recommendation contained in the Officer's report be approved and by a show of hands this was unanimously agreed.

RESOLVED that:-

- (i) subject to the conditions contained in the Officer's report this application be granted;
- the applicant be advised that the following policy of Caerphilly County Borough Local Development Plan up to 2021 - Adopted November 2010 is relevant to the conditions of this permission: CW2;
- (iii) the applicant be advised of the comments of Dwr Cymru/Welsh Water.

19. CODE NO. 15/0775/COU - BANK CHAMBERS, 2 PANDY ROAD, BEDWAS, CAERPHILLY, CF83 8EH

Having regard to the impact of the development on residential amenity, it was moved and seconded that the application be deferred for a site visit (all Members) and by a show of hands this was unanimously agreed.

RESOLVED that the application be deferred for a site visit.

20. CODE NO. 15/0914/FULL - CRAIG BACH, PENRHIW LANE, MACHEN, CAERPHILLY, CF83 8PX

Having regard to the impact of the development on residential amenity and the visual impact on the local landscape, it was moved and seconded that the application be deferred for a site visit (all Members) and by a show of hands this was unanimously agreed.

RESOLVED that the application be deferred for a site visit.

21. MEMBERS' PLANNING SITE VISITS

The report advised Members of the Royal Town Planning Institute (RTPI) research in relation to the operation of Planning Committees in Wales and their recommendations in relation to site visits. In order to meet the requirements of the Planning Wales Act 2016, the views of the Committee were sought on the suggested changes to the current site visit process, prior to the report being presented to Council for consideration.

In support of the Planning (Wales) Act 2015, the RTPI undertook research into the operation of Planning Committees in Wales and made a number of recommendations in relation to site visits which impacts on this Planning Authority's current site visit practice as outlined in the Constitution.

Officers presented to the Planning Committee the recommendations of the RTPI and the changes proposed to enable the introduction of a procedure compliant with these recommendations. Members were asked to note in particular the proposed change that requests for an application to be reported to Planning Committee should be made in writing to the Case Officer (or in their absence, any other officer of the Development Management Team) within 21 days of receiving the weekly list of planning applications, together with the proposed change that all site visits take place on the Monday before Planning Committee for applications being reported to the Committee. It was also explained that requests for formal site visits made at Planning Committee will only be allowed in exceptional circumstances.

During the course of the ensuing debate, concerns were raised in respect of the impact of the reduced timeframe for requesting that an application be brought to Planning Committee. Officers explained that recent Welsh Government (WG) legislation has determined that failure to determine "householder" applications within 16 weeks and other applications within 24 weeks will result in the return of the planning application fee and thus there is a need to expedite the determination of planning applications in order to avoid these sanctions. It was explained to Members that Planning Officers would be mindful of applications where site visits might be requested and would interact with interested parties accordingly. Members were also advised that the amended site visit protocol would be reviewed after a 12-month period.

Discussion took place regarding the RTPI recommendation that site visits be identified by Officers in consultation with the Chair. A Member suggested that this recommendation be extended within the revised protocol to include reference to the Vice-Chair. A query was also raised regarding the final decision in the event of any dispute about the need for a site visit and it was confirmed that this will be taken by the Chair and/or Vice Chair in consultation with the Head of Planning and Regeneration and/or the Development Control Manager, and be reflected in the revised protocol accordingly.

A concern was raised regarding the proposal to cease the informal part of the site visit (which permitted members of the public to enter into discussion with Officers and Members). Officers emphasised the need for site visits to become more efficient and undertaken in a more formal manner, and explained the potential issues arising if an application was subject to judicial review, in that the informal part of site visits are not minuted by Officers.

Members referenced the proposed change that Committee Services Officers no longer attend the site visits to take minutes and that Planning Officers instead prepare a briefing note to be presented at the Planning Committee. Concerns were expressed that the sense of impartiality in the preparation of additional information or matters arising from site visits could be lost.

Members were advised that in complying with the RTPI recommendations and WG legislation, it would not be possible to compose several site visit reports between the Monday site visits and the Wednesday Planning Committee meeting. Such reports would also have to be tabled at the meeting, which is not the preferred option in presenting information to Members. Assurances were also given that all Planning Officers are completely impartial when dealing with planning applications. The Development Control Manager advised that he would take these comments back to Committee Services for further discussion and also enquire with other local authorities as to their site visit procedures.

Following consideration of the report it was moved and seconded that subject to the inclusion of the amendments/comments raised by Members, the recommendations contained therein be endorsed and forwarded to Council for approval. By a show of hands this was unanimously agreed.

RECOMMENDED to Council that:-

- (i) subject to the foregoing amendments, the proposed changes to the site visit protocol as outlined in the Officer's report be approved;
- (ii) the Council's Monitoring Officer be authorised to make the relevant changes to the Council's Constitution.

22. PROPOSALS RELATING TO STRATEGIC PLANNING PANEL REGULATIONS: COMPOSITION AND FINANCIAL MATTERS

The report sought the approval of the Planning Committee on the Council's response to the Welsh Government's consultation in respect of proposals relating to Strategic Planning Panel Regulations in terms of their Composition and Financial Matters.

Welsh Government (WG) are currently running a number of consultations concerning changes to the planning system with a view to making it more positive. The changes are in respect of not only the development management system but also the development plan system in Wales.

The current consultation is in respect of proposals relating to Strategic Planning Panel Regulations in terms of their Composition and Financial Matters. The deadline for the submission of comments is 2nd November 2015.

Following consideration of the report it was moved and seconded that the recommendation contained therein be approved and by a show of hands this was unanimously agreed.

RESOLVED that the Council's response to the Welsh Government's consultation in respect of proposals relating to Strategic Planning Panel Regulations in terms of their Composition and Financial Matters be approved.

23. CHARGING FOR PRE-APPLICATION PLANNING ADVICE: REVIEW

The report outlined a review of charges for advice given by Development Management planners to the public and professional developers prior to the submission of planning applications, and for various other development management related services. The report also proposed alterations to the current scale of charges.

Members were informed that the majority of local planning authorities now charge for advice given at pre-application discussions and on other development management related matters. Caerphilly County Borough Council introduced similar charges on 1st April 2014 and a scale of charges was appended to the report. A total of £22,510 was collected in the 2014/2015 financial year (£2,510 above the expected budget) with the budget target for 2015/16 being £25,000.

Following consideration of the report it was moved and seconded that the recommendation contained therein be approved and by a show of hands this was unanimously agreed.

RESOLVED that the amendments to the scale of fees as set out in the report and contained in the appendix are adopted from 1st December 2015.

24. WELSH GOVERNMENT ANNUAL PERFORMANCE REVIEW

The report advised Members of the content of the Annual Performance Report (APR) which is to be sent to Welsh Government, and outlines the performance of the Planning Service over the financial year 2014-2015.

Members were informed that the Welsh Government has introduced the annual performance report as a result of the "Positive Planning" consultation it carried out in December 2013. They consulted on a series of proposals for measuring the performance of key stakeholders in the planning service, including local planning authorities, and proposed that stakeholders should prepare an annual report, discussing how their organisation had performed against the indicators, identifying what it had done well so that this can be shared with others, and what steps might be taken to address areas of performance in need of improvement. The first reports are due in November 2015.

Following consideration and discussion of the report it was moved and seconded that the recommendation contained therein be approved and by a show of hands this was unanimously agreed.

RESOLVED that the Council's Annual Performance Review for 2014-2015 be forwarded to Welsh Government.

25. ITEMS FOR INFORMATION

The following items were received and noted: -

- (1) Applications determined by delegated powers;
- (2) Applications which are out of time/not dealt with within 8 weeks of date of registration;
- (3) Applications awaiting completion of a Section 106 Agreement;
- (4) Appeals outstanding.

The meeting closed at 8.52 pm.

Approved as a correct record and subject to any amendments or corrections agreed and recorded in the minutes of the meeting held on 9th December 2015, they were signed by the Chair.

CHAIR